



Hermann Kreutzmann

# PAMIRIAN CROSSROADS

Kirghiz and Wakhi of High Asia

2015

Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden



*Dedicated to Sabine Felmy*

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Bibliothek:

Die Deutsche Bibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation  
in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie;  
detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.ddb.de> abrufbar.

Bibliographic information published by Die Deutsche Bibliothek:  
Die Deutsche Bibliothek lists this publication in  
the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the  
Internet at <http://dnb.ddb.de>

For further information about our publishing program please consult our  
website <http://www.harrassowitz.de/verlag>

© for this edition Otto Harrassowitz GmbH & Co. KG, Wiesbaden 2015

This work, including all of its parts, is protected by copyright.  
Any use beyond the limits of copyright law without the permission  
of the publisher is forbidden and subject to penalty. This applies  
particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage  
and processing in electronic systems.

Cover photograph: Hermann Kreutzmann  
Back cover: Demetrius Charles Boulger, 1878

Editors: Anne Beck and Sabine Felmy  
Photography: Hermann Kreutzmann except where dedicated otherwise  
Design and typography: Hermann Kreutzmann  
Desktop publishing and image processing: Harald Weller  
Cartography: Bernd Hilberer and Markus Hauser  
Printing and binding: Memminger MedienCentrum AG, Memmingen  
Printed on permanent/durable paper.

Printed in Germany · ISBN 978-3-447-10449-4

## CONTENTS

## Avant-propos 7

- Mapping the Pamirs and Wakhan 7
- Locating the arena 8
  - Approaches 8
  - Kirghiz and Wakhi communities 9
  - Ecology and economy in the Pamirs 9
  - Kirghiz and Wakhi migration in space and over time 10
  - Pastoralists across boundaries 10
  - Aspects and prospects 11
- Transliteration and transcription 11
- Acknowledgments 12
- Copyright 14

## Introduction 17

- Pamir and Wakhan – locating the arena 17
- Pamir 20
- From Buddhist pilgrims to colonial missions 22
- People and places 32
- Wakhan 39
- Borders and maps 42
- Natural boundaries and scientific borders 51
- Frontiers of contact versus frontiers of separation 58
- Taking refuge – people to places 60
- Coping with transformation 63

## Approaches 69

- Exploring the crossroads 69
- Asia and Europe – a widening gap 70
- Production of knowledge 71
- From Fergana, Kabul and Kashgar to the Pamirs 72
- Pamir and Wakhan – approach to the highlands 82
- Consolidating knowledge and playing the game 89
- Grombchevsky and Younghusband: two individuals driven by equal interests – representing rival powers 92
- The Gilgit Mission and Wakhan 96
- Shrinking ‘blank’ spaces and mapped desires 100
- Individual travellers on high ground 105
- Change of interests – from individual traveller to scientific expedition 112
- Gazetteers and handbooks for practice 114

## Closed borders 114

Exploring the roads – vehicular traffic in High Asia 116

## Wakhi and Kirghiz communities 127

- Imagination and persistence 127
- Conflicting classifications 127
- Denominational affiliations in space and time 137
- Nomads, pastoralists or combined mountain farmers 140
- Outsiders’ perceptions and attributions 141
- Collective terms and varying applications 144
- Distribution and diffusion – a spatial approach to mobility 146

## Chances and constraints for pastoral practices 151

- Ecology and economy in the Pamirs 151
  - Environmental constraints in Kirghiz and Wakhi settlement areas 152
  - Climatic conditions 156
  - Classification of the Pamirs 158
  - Pamirian pasture potential 163
- Passes and valleys – location of settlements 167
  - Built environment 167
  - The house and the yurt 175
- Wakhi livelihoods 176
  - Mountain agriculture and cropping systems 179
  - Farm size and cultivation patterns 183
  - Animal husbandry and high-mountain pastures 184
  - Pastoral practices in Shimshal 187
  - Variations in Wakhi combined mountain agriculture 189
- Kirghiz migration in space and time 190
- Kirghiz yak-keeping 195
- Relations and transitions 197

## Mobility and multi-locality in High Asia 205

- Kirghiz and Wakhi migration in space and over time 205
- Wakhan – maintaining independence despite external threat (1747–1872) 205
- Afghan and imperial pressure on Badakhshan (1872–1883) 216
- The Mir leaves Wakhan and half the population follows 221

- Effects of boundary-making (1883–1899) 229  
 Search for new abodes 249  
 Changing taxation and forced labour practices as a stimulus for mobilising Wakhi migrants (1899–1901) 255  
 Consolidation of states within newly created borders (1901–1919) 261  
 Political and religious discrimination in the Pamirs (1919–1949) 267  
 Collectivisation strategies 277  
 Border closures affecting exchange 281
- Migration as an adaptation strategy in High Asia 295  
 Forceful dislocation of people 295  
 Migration to reduce risk 300  
 Population dynamics among Wakhi 307  
 Population dynamics in Kirghiz enclaves 312
- Kirghiz pastoralists across boundaries 319  
 Kirghiz patterns of evasion and exchange 319  
 Kirghiz communities 322  
 Nomads and pastoralists in Central Asian peripheries 327  
 Life history of Khan Rahman Qul 335  
 Dissident Kirghiz in the Afghan Pamirs 342  
 Kirghiz communities – perceptions past and present 343  
 A long way to go 346
- Aspects and prospects 351  
 Winds of change in minority politics 351  
 Nation-building and regionalism of rural groups in Afghanistan: Wakhan Woluswali in Badakhshan 352  
 – Formation of a social hierarchy without a traditional ruling elite 352  
 – Exchange relations in a ‘closed frontier’ situation 356  
 – Trends in Wakhan since the Saur revolution in 1978 360  
 – The Afghan Pamirs and Wakhan in relation to the Northern Alliance 362  
 Soviet nationalities policy in Tajikistan: collectivisation and border protection in Gorno-Badakhshan 367  
 – The policy of national delimitation and administrative reforms in Gorno-Badakhshan 367  
 – Integration of the Pamir groups into the Tajik nation 373  
 – Stages of collectivisation in Gorno-Badakhshan 374  
 – Socio-economic transformation in the Wakhi communities and national integration processes 378
- Chinese minority policies in Xinjiang:  
 people’s communes in Sarikol 384  
 – Nationality policies and autonomy concepts 385  
 – Transformation of rural communities in China 387  
 – Minority policies in Xinjiang 388  
 – Collectivisation and regional autonomy in Xinjiang 389  
 – Wakhi in Sarikol 390  
 – Transformation processes in Sarikol 392  
 Absence of nationalities’ policies – minorities in Pakistan 397  
 – Ishkoman – from seat in exile to periphery 397  
 – Baroghil – pauperisation in a remote location 401  
 – Gojal – transition from outsider position to model of Ismaili integration? 406
- Portraying the present age 431  
 Afghan Wakhan 432  
 Little Pamir 439  
 Great Pamir 443  
 Rajon Ishkashim 445  
 Murghab District 449  
 Sarikol and Taghdumbash Pamir 456  
 Little Kara Kōl 463  
 Gojal 468  
 Ishkoman 472  
 Baroghil 472
- Epilogue 477  
 Scientific and sensitive boundaries in transition 477  
 Final words – shepherdesses in harsh environments 478
- Glossary of important terms and toponyms 485  
 Glossary 485  
 Pronunciation 492  
 Toponyms and meanings 493  
 Toponyms and previous transliterations and usages 494
- Bibliography 496  
 Archival collections, files, memoranda and primary sources 496  
 Bibliography of printed and published material 510  
 Bibliography of maps 546
- Index 552

5 Exceptions focusing on the broader region include Kreutzmann, *Pamirian Crossroads*. Levi-Sanchez, S., *The Afghan-Central Asia Borderland: The State and Local Leaders*, Routledge, London and New York, 2017. Google Scholar. Manetta, E., "Journey into Paradise: Tajik Representations of Afghan Badakhshan" *Central Asian Survey* 30 (4), 2011, pp. 371-387. CrossRef Google Scholar. Kreutzmann, *Pamirian Crossroads*.<sup>89</sup> The Pamirian Crossroads have been a thoroughfare for pilgrims, refugees, traders and nomads over long periods of time. The harsh environment has provided home for mountain farmers and pastoralists. Nevertheless, the Pamirian Crossroads were a contested arena during the Great Game and functioned as a buffer during the Cold War. In recent years the new Silk... Hermann Kreutzmann's *Pamirian Crossroads* is a remarkable work of scholarship and a major contribution to our understanding of livelihood. Kreutzmann seeks to redress this picture through a focus on Pamirian crossroads. One of his important conclusions is that the high Pamirian Crossroads highlights these marginal borderlands in four neighbouring countries - Afghanistan, Pakistan, China and Tajikistan - and analyses the differentiating effects of imperial designs, colonial boundary-making, political intervention and administrative reforms on people living in a mountain environment. The mosaic of community challenges, a variety of group and individual responses, experiences of authoritarian pressure and power politics resulting in enhanced mobility...